900 Fort Street Mall Suite 1160 · Honolulu, HI 96813 · PH: (808) 536-6999 · FAX: (808) 524-4998 · www.townscapeinc.com

Date: March 22, 2023
To: Project Files
From: Townscape, Inc.

Re: Waikapuna – Community Meeting on Draft Plan

Meeting Attendees: Meeting attendees were asked to sign-in via a Google Form. Only 23 participants signed-in, but approximately 55 participants total joined the meeting online or called in by phone. Participants from the consultant team included Sherri Hiraoka and Gabrielle Sham (Townscape, Inc.). County of Hawai'i staff (Maxine Cutler, Hamana Ventura, and Jean Campbell) also attended the meeting, and Keoni Fox represented Ala Kahakai Trail Association (ATA).

This memo documents the virtual community meeting held on Wednesday, March 22, 2023 via Zoom for the <u>Waikapuna Resources Management Plan</u>. The purpose of the meeting was to share the draft management plan and gather feedback.

Gabrielle Sham started the meeting at 6:30 p.m. She provided a <u>slideshow</u> presentation that shared the draft management plan. A recording of the meeting is available <u>online</u>.

Questions and/or comments from participants are provided below. Responses from the community meeting are shown in *italics*. Follow-up responses provided by the consultants, County, and/or ATA (after the community meeting) are provided below in *red italics*.

- I went to Waikapuna and above the cliff area, there are some really beautiful bubbly rock features with depression. They're very appealing. My feeling is they should actually remain there, but they're the kind of thing that people will be drawn to and will appeal to people and some of them are rather small and look like vases and stuff like that. How do you protect those pohaku?
 - Building public awareness of the sensitive resources will be key, along with working with the community to educate the public about the resources.
- What is the oversight for the Conservation Easement grant?
 - ATA has to submit an annual report to the County; the County will be responsible for conducting annual monitoring.
- Is there any community involvement with the annual monitoring/report?
 - We will have to take another look at the Conservation Easement grant agreement.
 - The County will look to involve staff and/or contract an outside party with knowledge in long-range planning, and Hawaiian cultural practices and resilience, in the annual monitoring process. In addition, the County will welcome member(s) of the Ka`u community to attend and provide knowledge and historical perspective as part of the annual monitoring process.

• As I was reading through the conservation easement grant agreement, I ran across the legal description of the property, and also briefly looked at the history of the title of the property. And so, one thing that I've been putting out there to people, whether it be the Department of the Interior or even the National Science Foundation, when we're talking about lineal descendants having rights and interests or rights in decision making processes. They're always putting the onus of who the lineal descendants are, they need to come forward and present themselves. I would just like to suggest that because of the title of the property, the chain of the title, and the fact that, you know, we do know who the family names are, of the families that have rights or whatever interest in this area is known. I mean, I don't know that it's ATA's responsibility, but I'm starting to feel that in this day and age, they should be a way for the land owner, to be able to reach out to the lineal descendants, instead of saying 'lineal descendants come', you know.

I feel that the State and maybe even the Federal government, but especially the State, all the palapala of the titles of the land. And I mean, I don't know whether State has to actually do genealogy, but I'm like, whether it's, you know, a notice in the newspaper, I mean, there. There are ways, there should be ways that they, I'm talking like Department of Interior and the United States of America, you want people's input? Well, it's your responsibility as trustees to reach out to find these people to locate them and to allow them a chance to have input.

- To do like the volunteer cleanup, which I always seem to miss...I was wondering if there's like a schedule of when [the volunteer cleanups will be held], because I always seem to find out when I don't have enough advance notice to go. And then you were talking about the volunteer thing and how that would work regarding the scheduling, so that if you volunteered, then you would have prioritized access. But that the volunteers would have their own weekend when there wouldn't be overnight camping alone. So I was kind of confused how that works. So do the volunteers just go whenever they want? Or do they first have their own priority? Or is that the same as the people? Are they grouped together with the people that volunteer with them? Or I was kind of confused home is the volunteer groups and the people that volunteer with them in the same priority? So if I volunteer, theoretically, I could have priority I could schedule to have overnight and then they wouldn't be able to go down and clean up. That's kind of the way I heard it.
 - Regarding the timeline and schedule for the volunteer cleanups, we are currently working on finalizing the management plan. We hope to complete the management plan by May timeframe. Shortly after that, it'll take ATA sometime to get everything together, but our understanding is that ATA will probably try to have an least an organized volunteer work day by July. ATA should also be updating their website once the management plan is finalized, so to find out more information definitely check ATA's website. On the website, you can currently submit you information to let them know that you are interested in volunteering.
 - To answer your other question related to where I had mentioned, that one weekend, would be designated for volunteers only. To clarify, the one weekend a month for volunteers is NOT for overnight access, but will be designated for organized volunteer work. ATA will organize an event where people can all come together and volunteer together as a group. There won't be overnight access during that weekend to avoid conflicts between the two uses. It's also a time for the place to rest.

- So I know, part of the concern was more on the southerly side where people are
 crossing over from Kamilo. And I know you address that specifically. And I didn't maybe I
 missed that in the draft management plan about how that would fit into, because
 wouldn't that be like an overnight, like watch dog group? Are how would that fit into the
 reservation? And/or day use aspect?
 - The public can access Waikapuna by foot at any time from the south side of Waikapuna. When we're talking about providing overnight access through the reservation system, we are referring to providing vehicular access via the access easement from Nā'ālehu.
 - Any organized overnight volunteer activities such as a makai watch will be coordinated separately from the reservation system.
- I guess the concern in one of the previous meetings was that people would take like their four wheelers from Kamilo and just roll up, and there wasn't really any way to regulate that. And so my understanding that we were talking about tonight was that there will be some kind of makai watch program.
 - The community makai watch program is a way of getting the community more involved in protecting resources, typically common in managing fisheries. The State DOCARE only has so much capacity, but the community makai watch could be a way to get the community involved to be the eyes and ears. If there's people there, you can talk to them, maybe share about the resources here and, hopefully, encourage some behavioral changes.
- [Are the volunteer opportunities] set for the entire year, at the beginning of the year, or how was that prioritized?
 - We are working through the management plan right now. It will take some time for ATA to implement and I would assume that once we finalize the plan, that ATA will share with the public, maybe through their website, when the volunteer opportunities will occur.
- I'm calling in to inquire a little bit more on the reservation process. I get the idea that volunteers get access on that first [Monday] month to be able to put in reservations, then Ka'ū residents on the second Monday to put in reservations. I guess the question becomes on the third Monday, is it open to everyone or Hawaii residents only? Are there any thoughts on limiting the size of groups? If you volunteer on that first month, are you then able to bring people with you? And if so, any thought given to how many, and what other parameters might be placed on that?
 - I understand that currently, there are some limitations to the group size. It would probably be the same or similar limitations to the group size (although not exactly sure what the exact number, but I think it would kind of follow the similar kind of rules that's been occurring. For the third week, it would be open to anyone to make a reservation during that week.
 - o The limits are currently 8 people per group and up to three vehicles. There is a liability waiver which will need to be signed by all visitors. All guests must be present for a briefing on safety and protocol on the day of the visit. If the person submitting the reservation request is not familiar with Waikapuna and the access road, they must attend a quarterly educational hike first so that they can be

introduced to the place. This is an opportunity to learn about Waikapuna's sensitive cultural and natural resources, unique history, and safety hazards.

- So that could also include people visiting from off Island or tourists?
 - The person submitting the request must be familiar with Waikapuna and the access road. This person can be visiting from off island but Waikapuna should not be regarded as a tourist destination or vacation spot.
- I just had a follow up to the question that was just asked, and that that has to do with access to camping? And is it still taken over a year to get a campsite down there?
 - I'm actually not sure how far out the reservations are currently booked out. I just know in the past, throughout the last year, while we were talking story with community folks, that the reservations were booked out really far out.
 - Reservations for the overnight weekend access is currently booked about four to five months out.
- Also, when is the next meeting? And can we just get together at the Nāʿālehu
 Community Center? I think it's important for a lot of my neighbors and myself that we
 meet here, you know, the kind we can see each other in person. And, you know, we still
 have a lot of issues with technology in the district. I'm sure there'd be a lot more people
 involved if we can meet face to face. There's no pandemic anymore. There's no reason
 we can't be face to face. That's all I have. Thanks so much.
 - We're taking comments on the draft plan and accepting comments for the next 30 days. If you have any comments specific to the management plan, you can email, call, mail in your comments. But shortly after that, we will be finalizing the management plan. I'm not sure if ATA will have a meeting to share their implementation process, but that's something we can find out and get back to you on.
- Thanks for the invitation. The question I had is what I emailed you really is, you know, looking at I guess changes back in the hometown. You know, having trust and transparency probably is needed just to kind of start off right. But having that trusted agent on the committee's boards will give that transparency that hey, this is what's going on. And here's what really the why behind it if that makes sense. And also, you know why the community days or you know, one are being controlled, not controlled, hosted by ATA, and who has a vote in that. But also, I see the implementation, the implementation is monitored by the CDP, the folks on the CDP. So, you know, I think there's enough folks involved, but having someone sit on the committee, on the Stewardship Committee, especially from Ka'ū, a trusted agent, I think that will go a long way.
 - If anyone's interested in participating or being involved in the Stewardship Committee, please reach out to ATA. Information is on their website about getting involved as part of the Stewardship Committee.
 - Most of the existing stewardship committee members are from Ka'ū.
 - You also mentioned about implementation of the plan being overseen by the CDP? Can you clarify, not sure if that is accurate.
- It's in the management planning. It states that the Ka'ū Community Development Plan, so the CDP members who developed the plan will help to implement the ATA's Plan.

There's some folks on the line here that are on the CDP committee, so they can probably answer it.

- We will have to take another look at that. The Ka'ū Community Development Plan Action Committee is responsible for implementing the CDP which is separate from the Waikapuna Management Plan. <u>Ka'ū Community</u> <u>Development Plan | Hawaii County, HI Planning</u>
- In the past, the way the land was managed, residents could have a short term access, when the weather's good to gather, you know, to fish, to gather. Is it provisions in the management plan that find that that could still be possible? Or is it still by reservation, which, which means that if you want to go down for a day or for a couple hours, you might put it in? And you might get it? And you might not? It might be two months off? It might be three months off? Is there is there a provision for a short term allowance, a quick thing? Because of weather. You know, when the weather turns good.
 - It is. We talked a lot about weekend overnight access, but as you may recall, the management plan also allows for kūpuna and 'ohana days. And those [days] are really meant to address what you just brought up...access when the conditions good, the weather's good. It's intended to be just one day access where reservations are made the Monday of that week, so nothing that you would reserve far out in advance.
- And that would have to be done on a Monday? So if conditions are good on a Monday, and then you go, I'm going to call up and then go, I can go Friday, but then quick conditions are not good on Friday, and you have to cancel. But that's just the arrangement, right?
 - I mean, usually, can I ask you a question? How far in advance would you need advance notice of when you might want to go down there for?
- Well, that's what I'm saying. Down here, we're subject to the weather. And the weather could hinder it for many, you know, for many places for a long time. But sometimes, like we just came through, we had some really nice weather, which gathering for certain things is...you can...when you normally can't, but if the conditions turn good, and there's no provision to be able to take advantage of the weather, then that's my question. That's really my question. Because in the past, you could call up whoever was stewarding the land and say, 'Is there access to the beach today? Oh, yes. Come get the access.'
- [Comment from the chat box] Mel asked if [Townscape] is going to be posting comments from everyone, as well as responses.
 - My initial response was that we would post a summary of comments and some brief responses. And then there was a request to share all of the comments verbatim. I guess our concern was that sometimes there's duplicate comments. And so just to keep things simple for everyone and not have to go through pages and pages of comments, we wanted to just kind of condense the ones that were similar so that people could just really easily see what the main comments were. There was also another concern once in a while, people don't necessarily want to share their comment publicly. But I think if everyone is okay with it, and they would like to see all of the verbatim comments, we can certainly put those together. I was wondering if anybody on this meeting had any concerns about sharing comments publicly?

- This meeting is recorded, and we will be sharing it online. So that's another
 opportunity to have access to the verbatim comments.
- [From the chat box] There are a couple other follow up comments that were saying that people were interested in seeing verbatim comments.
- [From the chat box] Another comment about how there's 52 weekends each year. So that's, like 104 families per year doing overnight access. There was a recommendation that could residents have reservation priority over volunteer and non-Ka'ū residents.
 - We have heard that [recommendation] in the past, too. I totally understand giving preference to Ka'ū residents, but is there a way to also encourage folks to volunteer or to help mālama the place?
- So getting back to that comment about the Ka'ū residents and non-Ka'ū residents. Can you define what a resident is? Are we talking about lineal cultural descendants, or somebody who just moved from the mainland and lived here a year, and they just have to have a license that shows residence that they're living in Ka'ū. I would like to know the definition of what Ka'ū resident is.
 - We haven't really defined it. Generally, the easiest way for implement is by your zip code and where you reside, but that's something that the project team can think about.
- We've been kind of communicating with the National Park and I sat with Kepa Maly on Friday. And we were kind of trying to, like, have some kind of line of where that is. And, you know, like the true Ka'ū resident, I think would be, you know, to have access with somebody from Ka'ū, like lineal cultural descendant from Ka'ū, if you lived here 20 years, I mean, you'd have to have made friends somehow within the community, and you could go down with that person with that kind of Ka'ū tie, versus somebody who just came and then, you know, they have their zip code and their license show that their resident but, you know, really, what is their interest in places like this, besides, you know, like, recreation or whatnot. But, I mean, we kind of getting locked out of a lot of places that we were, you know, brought up with. And so I think, really defining that is important for people who've been here for multitudes of generations.
- I going to echo on Nohea. You know, in the beginning it was kind of, was kind of sketchy how the situation was going. But ever since Nohea, she knew us. She know who we are. So it was easy for her recognize us knowing that we only went down there for get what we want for our family to eat and stuff. So I kinda was wondering about their whole thing because their concept comes from the National Park with the Kalapana family. So people from Kalapana with the National Park, people no can just go down to the beach, you gotta go down with a resident, because the the resident will be responsible for the safety and the knowledge of the place. See, because of this whole situation, now, we're in one predicament, well, it's not about sharing, it's about we've got to educate all these people that are wondering, and they're looking at the social media of how beautiful the white sand beach is. You know, for us, for Ka'ū people, this is our livelihood. And to go to the point, where eh I gotta prove my genealogy is like whoa, wait a minute here. You know, then certain individuals should do the same as far as residents being here, raised here. You know, now getting back to what Jason was saying about Kamilo. Now all of a sudden because of the adjacent beaches from Pohinapali all the way to Waikapuna and now from Ka'alu'alu to Kamilo to Waikapuna, get some shenanigans going on. And I'm

kind of guestionable about that kind of situation. You know, because now all of a sudden we cannot go here, we cannot go there. So this whole Waikapuna implementation. Now even it wen broaden to the Pohinapali and back, all the way to Ka'alu'alu. Now, that situation is gonna get out of hand. Because shoreline access...we all got to understand Article 12, Section 7, that's native gathering rights. This is how we feed our family. And eventually I getting old, so my son feeding us, then my grandson gonna feed us. You know, you hearing the government saying 'our resources. Go back to your resources.' But it seems like the resource is getting taken away from us because the grants, big money grants in the rules that we gotta follow. That place been untouched for years because we follow what we know and what we were taught for generations. So when we talk malama, we malama. We take care. So now, you guys are all welcome to see that place, the way it is for generations for years pass...because we as the Ka'ū residents, we took care of that place. We had no hana'ino or hakaka with this place. But now all of a sudden the American dollar comes into the picture, we get all these kind of situations. You know, so I'm kind of leery. I read the whole thing. Now we get him back to the ranch and all these leases and stuff. Now with all these implementations on fencing and stone walls and gates, who's going to pony up the funding for that? Who's going to pony up the labor for that? The costs. I mean it's one thing to tell somebody 'hey, I like you go do this, I like you go do that.' Oh, put the money where the mouth is, no? I say it like it is. All this stewardship grants getting big money but no more nothing for show for...how many years? Yah, I'm going to ask the hard questions. I getting old. I just fighting for my grandson and fighting for my son and everybody that grows up here. And like I say that's why I said Nohea is a big factor because when all this problem was going on, the minute you gotta go see Nohea and sign for the keys and she state the rules with her and the Ohana, she knows us...so we don't need to go through the whole genealogy facts, she knows where we live. She knows we from Ka'ū. She knows we know down there. So that's why you know run smooth from the prior I talk to you Gaby. When run smooth, because she knows. So if everybody should be one of those guys, they're going to be on to implement this whole thing about the planning and stuff, she should be on that committee and I hope she is...because she's easy to go to.

Well, you know, I had one phone call I'm gonna get blown up... now we, this braddah, born and raised Ka'ū...this water was malia, everybody that is from Ka'ū they know...the water was nice...it's when all these young boys, these young men they like go dive. The the water was nice, but he start blowing up my phone...he gotta call here, he gotta call there...he never knew what was going on. And then 'oh no can, only can go on the weekend.' This weekend...the water changed. The water was nice during the week... wasn't nice on Saturday, it changed up. This is why Ka'ū, why that place was special. Because when the water nice is when we can go...see the weather gonna tell us, when the weather stay bust up or where the water rough, nobody gonna go. That's the benefit of the people in Ka'ū and that's why that beaches hold plenty...so outsiders like to go South Point and Honolulu guys like go rent go Kahuku Beach and pay for that...they go. But Waikapuna and Leipana...all the way to Pohina was special because not everybody could go, you know. Now we gonna share, okay, fine, we gonna share, but share right. Because now it seems like now we're gonna have to go to KTA. We gonna have to go to supermarkets. We teach our kids, 'you hunt, you fish, you don't starve. You don't starve.' To me, it's like no can bring the city to the country and tell how the country guys how to live. That's not cool. That's not nice. You know? And again, I want to emphasize on the management plan on the ranching part. Who's gonna implement that? The expense for

the fence, the stone wall, the gates. Who's going to implement that? The finances for that? See these ranchers, we gotta take care of 'em. These are the ones donating when we had the pandemic. O Ka'ū Kakou giving away hamburgers and meat for the kūpuna. Where did you think that came from? The local ranchers. Gave them to Kawachi and now you like make it more hard for them? Because personal vendettas...we no cannot have that. No? We no can, it's not nice. That's not Ka'ū way.

Ka'ū way...we help each other...rather one funeral, one baby party, what have you. We help each other. Whether you need smoke me, you need something, we give. And I know everybody here hear what I'm saying because they know that. But if nobody gonna talk the right talk, then I gonna talk. Because I promised myself, I wasn't gonna say anything. But it seems like we went all over the place. But what is the concern? And the concern is local residents should be a part of it. And as far as volunteering, it's not a problem to volunteer. But you know what's so crazy about volunteering...when you get the guys with the nice trucks, because they get the grant, they get the money to put the gas in their nice trucks because they get the grant. And then they go down because they're getting paid by the grant for go clean up...certain beaches down here. But they asked for volunteers so we go down, we'll help with our personal vehicles, our own gas. After a while you're gonna get burnt out and you're gonna you can kind of put two and two together. Now, so when you ask for volunteers, it's not you volunteer, you get options. No. You volunteer because you love down there. And you want to make a difference to down there. I want to echo what Mel was saying because his father is a good fisherman and I make flies for the father, for catch menpachi and red fish. So the thing is, how are we going to implement all this? Right? That's the thing. Cuz I think about you know where we call Leipana and that's adjacent to Waikapuna and we call this place Toko place, the old man Toko. So brother should be listening in right about now to what I'm talking. So Toko, the old man, I talk story with him down the beach...he comes down, the wife makes small kine musubi for him...he only goes to that place, that one spot...at night just for little while, just for catch five, six redfish...for him and his wife. old man Toko...so after that we start calling 'em Toko Place. Now the situation with down there, Leipana, because you know just like Waikapuna, you cannot go over the lava road because you cannot drive over a cave. We was raised in the cave. We know everything about down there.

Yeah, but you see, that's the big picture. Okay, that's the big picture. The big picture is Ka'alu'alu get one stewardship going on over there, no? Now because Ka'alu'alu to Kamilo gets to Waikapuna...Leipana, from Leipana gets to Waikapuna. Now of a sudden, we get this whole holding of the coastline because of the Waikapuna problem. So what I'm talking about the Toko Place...now if that man was still alive, God bless him. You will tell him you no can catch five, six red fish for his wife because he cannot drive over the lave to go to his point...only to catch five red fish for him and his family, for real? It's not cool. But I guess that's how it is, eh, because people that are raised in the city, born in the city, from Ka'ū, say they are Hawaiian, but they don't live Hawaiian, then don't raise their kids to be Hawaiian...for learn the resources and share. No, it doesn't mean you gotta be Hawaiian. You can get the Filipino boys, the Japanese boys. These boys all know. The Ka'ū way. It's not a Hawaiian thing. It's a Ka'ū way. But there is that problem of Ka'alu'alu and Leipana from Pohinapali, you should really look into that part. Because that is affecting this whole management with Waikapuna because that's what our Masters was talking about coming from Kamilo.

Additional comments/questions posted on the chat box but not addressed during the meeting are provided below.

- 52 weekends per year. That's 104 "families" per year (overnight). Recommend Ka'u residents have reservation priority over volunteer and non-Kau residents.
- I agree with Mel Yokoyama...
- I agree with Mr. Yokoyama. Ka'u residents should have reservation priority.
- Why weren't cultural descendants not included in the structural format?
- How will the management be funded?
 - In the initial phase, ATA will look to the Stewardship Committee to assist on a voluntary basis. The public is welcome to join the Stewardship Committee if they are interested. Please see ATA's website. ATA will need to seek funding through grants and private donations for the proposed Administrative Coordinator and Resource Specialists positions. Some stewardship actions may be completed with the assistance of community volunteers.
- Would you folks be fencing the entire property? how would you keep people from making their own road into the property from South Point side?
 - There are no immediate plans to fence the entire property. However the draft plan recommends signage, markers or fencing where appropriate to prevent offroad vehicles from entering the property from the south. Monitoring would be conducted through a community makai watch program.
- Are fencing and gates in place to keep the cattle away from all these sites? If not, when will they be implemented? How much cattle are we talking about?
 Iwi Kupuna? Are they specific sites where iwi has been found? How are they protected?
 - o Installation of fence/gate is proposed to keep the cattle from traversing beyond their pasture areas, along with repair the cattle ranch wall. There is iwi within the parcel and will be closely monitored to ensure that it is protected.
- Nana-Honua, you raised a good point with Kuleana, LCA, RP Lands... there's a meeting this Saturday, March 25, 2023 at 10am, Nā'ālehu Community Center where anyone can come to learn about that process.
- What type of land leasing does ATA offer? Will there be leases for small parcels? For how long can an area be leased for, and what is the cost per 1acre? Maybe for agriculture purposes?
 - There are two existing leases for ranching. These lease agreements were in place prior to the acquisition of the property by ATA. At the current time, there is no plan for leasing out smaller parcels. Use of the parcel must also be aligned within the County and State's grant agreements.
- Here's the link to "Ka'u Community Development Plan." <u>https://www.hawaiicounty.gov/home/showdocument?id=304234&t=63779991405137000</u>
- Great question Nohea
- Good point uncle
- Mahalo Kalani
- I was talking about the people doing it not malama, for commercial kine

For information on volunteer opportunities and to sign up, please visit <u>ATA's webpage on stewardship</u>. (https://www.alakahakaitrail.org/aina-stewardship)

Waikapuna Resources Management Plan Virtual Community Meeting Notes – March 22, 2023 Page 10 of 10

For more information on Waikapuna, including the Stewardship Hui and its membership (scroll down), please see the ATA Waikapuna Web Page. (https://www.alakahakaitrail.org/waikapuna)

The meeting ended approximately at 8:00 p.m.